

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF OHIO
EASTERN DIVISION

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

vs.

Criminal Action 2:18-cr-229(2)
JUDGE JAMES L. GRAHAM

JERALYN R. DOUGHERTY

REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION

The United States of America and defendant Jeralyn R. Dougherty entered into a plea agreement¹ whereby defendant agreed to enter a plea of guilty to one count of health care fraud in violation of 18 U.S.C. §§ 1347, 2 (Count 1), and one count of filing false individual income tax returns in violation of 26 U.S.C. § 7206(1) (Count 3). *Information*, ECF No. 1. The *Information* also contains a forfeiture count in which the United States seeks to forfeit any interest that defendant may have in the proceeds of six bank accounts. *Id.* On February 13, 2019, defendant, accompanied by her counsel,² appeared for an initial appearance, arraignment, and entry of guilty plea proceeding. Defendant consented, pursuant to 28 U.S.C. §636(b)(3), to enter a guilty plea before a Magistrate Judge. *See United States v. Cukaj*, 2001 WL 1587410 at *1 (6th Cir. 2001)(Magistrate Judge may accept a guilty plea with the express consent of the defendant and where no objection to the report and recommendation is filed). Defendant also waived her right to an indictment in open court and after being advised of the nature of the charge and of her rights. *See Fed. R. Crim P. 7(b).*

¹ The *Plea Agreement*, ECF No. 3, was executed pursuant to the provisions of Fed. R. Crim. P. 11(c)(1)(C) and includes an appellate waiver provision that preserves only certain claims for appeal. Under the *Plea Agreement*, defendant also agreed to forfeit any interest that she may have in the bank proceeds referred to in the *Information*, and also agreed to make restitution to the affected health benefit plans and the Internal Revenue Service.

² Defendant is represented in this action by the same counsel as her co-defendant. The Court conducted an inquiry consistent with the provisions of Rule 44(c) of the Federal Rules of Criminal Procedure, after which defendant expressly waived her right to the effective assistance of conflict-free counsel.

During the plea proceeding, the undersigned observed the appearance and responsiveness of defendant in answering questions. Based on that observation, the undersigned is satisfied that, at the time she entered her guilty plea, defendant was in full possession of her faculties, was not suffering from any apparent physical or mental illness, and was not under the influence of narcotics or alcohol.

Prior to accepting defendant's plea, the undersigned addressed defendant personally and in open court and determined her competence to plead. Based on the observations of the undersigned, defendant understands the nature and meaning of the charges against her in the *Information* and the consequences of her plea of guilty to those charges. Defendant was also addressed personally and in open court and advised of each of the rights referred to in Rule 11 of the Federal Rules of Criminal Procedure.

Having engaged in the colloquy required by Rule 11, the Court concludes that defendant's plea is voluntary. Defendant acknowledged that the plea agreement signed by her, her attorney and the attorney for the United States and filed on October 31, 2018, represents the only promises made by anyone regarding the charges against her in the *Information*. Defendant was advised that the District Judge may accept or reject the plea agreement. Defendant was further advised that, if the Court refuses to accept the plea agreement, defendant will have the opportunity to withdraw his guilty plea but that, if he does not withdraw his guilty plea, the District Judge may impose a sentence that is more severe than the sentence contemplated in the plea agreement, up to the statutory maximum.

Defendant confirmed the accuracy of the statement of facts supporting the charges, which is attached to the *Plea Agreement*. She confirmed that she is pleading guilty to Counts 1 and 3 of the *Information* because she is in fact guilty of those offenses. The Court concludes that there is a factual basis for the plea.

The Court concludes that defendant's plea of guilty to Counts 1 and 3 of the *Information* is knowingly and voluntarily made with

understanding of the nature and meaning of the charges and of the consequences of the plea.

It is therefore **RECOMMENDED** that defendant's guilty plea to Counts 1 and 3 of the *Information* be accepted. Decision on acceptance or rejection of the plea agreement was deferred for consideration by the District Judge after the preparation of a presentence investigation report.

In accordance with S.D. Ohio Crim. R. 32.1, and as expressly agreed to by defendant through counsel, a written presentence investigation report will be prepared by the United States Probation Office. Defendant will be asked to provide information; defendant's attorney may be present if defendant so wishes. Objections to the presentence report must be made in accordance with the rules of this Court.

If any party seeks review by the District Judge of this *Report and Recommendation*, that party may, within fourteen (14) days, file and serve on all parties objections to the *Report and Recommendation*, specifically designating this *Report and Recommendation*, and the part thereof in question, as well as the basis for objection thereto. 28 U.S.C. §636(b)(1); F.R. Civ. P. 72(b). Response to objections must be filed within fourteen (14) days after being served with a copy thereof. F.R. Civ. P. 72(b).

The parties are specifically advised that failure to object to the *Report and Recommendation* will result in a waiver of the right to *de novo* review by the District Judge and of the right to appeal the decision of the District Court adopting the *Report and Recommendation*. See *Thomas v. Arn*, 474 U.S. 140 (1985); *Smith v. Detroit Federation of Teachers, Local 231 etc.*, 829 F.2d 1370 (6th Cir. 1987); *United States v. Walters*, 638 F.2d 947 (6th Cir. 1981).

February 13, 2019
Date

s/ Norah McCann King
Norah McCann King
United States Magistrate Judge